University of Warwick

Teaching Excellence Framework Submission 2017/18

1. Institutional Context

1. The University of Warwick is committed to providing a gold-standard educational experience for all students, enabling the achievement of outstanding academic and career outcomes. For over fifty years, our mission has been to equip all our students with the knowledge and skills to build their place in a global society, to enable them to stretch and work creatively and flexibly within and across disciplinary boundaries, and to achieve their full potential in employability and career progression. The University's outstanding achievements in education and research are reflected in national and international rankings, with Warwick ranked 57th in the QS World Rankings 2018, 91st in the Times Higher World University Rankings 2018, and 8th in REF2014. Warwick has consistently featured in the top 10 student experience-focussed national league tables for the past quarter of a century, currently ranking 8th in the Complete University Guide and the Guardian and 9th in the Times and Sunday Times Good University Guide 2018. Our exceptional student experience has gained particular recognition through Warwick being named 2015 University of the Year (Times and Sunday Times) and 17th most international university in the world (THES 2017).

2. The excellence of Warwick's education provision and support and the great talents of its students are demonstrated by the metrics for progression into highly skilled employment and further study, with 3 positive flags in our TEF core metrics, and 19 single and double positive flags and no negatives in our split metrics across both employability categories. The Longitudinal Education Outcomes (LEO) metrics, with a double positive flag on the core majority mode and 14 further single and double positive flags across the split metrics, demonstrate that 3 years post-graduation earnings for Warwick alumni are above the median threshold and significantly above benchmark in the upper decile, and 5 years post-graduation exceed the average level of sustained employment outcomes of Russell Group comparators as well as the rest of the sector. The QS World University Rankings 2016/17 placed Warwick in the top 25 in the world for reputation amongst employers. Warwick is 1st in the High Fliers ranking of institutions most targeted by the UK's top graduate employers, and has been in the top 5 for the last 10 years. The Economist 2017 rankings that assess the value-added for employability of a university degree programme placed Warwick 3rd in the Russell Group and 17th in the sector. [SO1, SO2]

3. Warwick delivers teaching and learning through a comprehensive range of academic disciplines, encompassing 33 departments and 50 research centres and institutes spanning the four Faculties of Arts, Medicine, Sciences and Social Sciences. Each discipline has its distinctive approach to pedagogical excellence within the boundaries of that discipline. In addition, a Warwick education is characterised by learning *beyond* boundaries, with interdisciplinarity, internationalisation, and student research as key features. Warwick's education provision is therefore strongly grounded in academic excellence but is outward looking in nature and underpins the outstanding contributions Warwick graduates make to society and economy.

4. Strong reciprocal partnership between staff and students—reflecting its role in originating the 'student as producer' approach—is also distinctive to Warwick. The presence of the student voice is pervasive and fully embedded, both formally and informally, in teaching and learning enhancement, quality assurance, policy development and operational management of the student learning experience. Students and staff work together constantly, avoiding a transactional or service delivery approach in order to achieve outstanding provision for all.

5. Whilst Warwick's education provision is rightfully and widely acknowledged for its national and international excellence, staff and students have continued to enhance our outstanding student experience and outcomes. Positioning student interests at the very heart of its focus, the

University community of staff and students conducted an all-discipline, campus-wide Institutional Teaching and Learning Review (ITLR) and a further Academic Governance Review between 2015 and 2017 to assist in setting the future trajectory of Warwick's education strategy and provision. These institutional strategic efforts have expanded Warwick's commitment to enhancing the student learning experience through ongoing and new investments in human, physical and digital resources. The University has created an Education Executive—consisting of over £550k p.a. of investment in a new Deputy Pro-Vice-Chancellor (Education) position and 6 Academic Director positions in the areas of undergraduate study, postgraduate study, partnerships, employability and skills, student experience and engagement, and pastoral support—to drive institutional change, focus on student interests, and deliver educational excellence in a rapidly developing external environment. Student leaders naturally participated in the process of appointment for these roles. Revised governance structures at departmental, faculty and University-level provide greater focus on strategy implementation, widening participation, and student engagement, with student representation greatly strengthened at all levels. The committee overseeing the student learning experience is co-chaired by the elected Students' Union Education Officer and the Academic Director for Student Experience and Engagement. The University has continued to expand its investment in the highest quality and innovative physical spaces for education, with a total of £66.6m invested over the period 2012-17 and a further £57.5m of capital investments in train in 2017/18 linked to education. An ambitious Student Personalised Information Programme (SPIP) was initiated in 2015 with a total commitment of £12m to deliver an integrated, seamless and personalised interface and learning environment in order to empower students to make effective choices during their studies and to support their development and progression. [LE1, LE3, SO2]

The Metrics

6. As was the case for a number of providers, the University of Warwick's Students' Union voted to boycott the NSS in 2017 given its concerns regarding the TEF and the link to fees. The response rate for the NSS in 2017 was consequently 57%: 26% lower than the response rate of 83% in 2016. The publication threshold of 50% was therefore achieved but response rates were highly variable across subjects, with 16 of 39 eligible JACS3 subjects not reaching the publication threshold. Although it is not possible to predict outcomes otherwise, of the 19 subjects with satisfaction rates of over 90% in 2016 for Teaching, 13 did not meet the publication threshold. This suggests that Warwick's 2017 NSS metrics should be considered with some caution as to their limitations in demonstrating normal student engagement with Warwick's education provision, especially in light of the extensive collaboration of students and staff in recent years to jointly enhance the student experience.

2. Teaching Quality

7. The University's ITLR periodic review enabled all academic departments to address issues of quality assurance and enhancement, including their approaches to the key teaching characteristics of signature disciplinary pedagogies, interdisciplinarity, internationalisation, and student research. ITLR involved 77 days of review; 37 review panels; evaluation of 786 courses; and participation of 329 Warwick staff, 296 students, and 30 external panel members. Professional services supporting education were also reviewed to ensure a holistic view of the student experience. The reviews were followed by 4 Faculty engagements at which thematic issues relevant to each Faculty were considered. All reviews were undertaken by panels comprising staff and students. Subsequent evaluation showed that 96% of survey respondents considered the engagement of student panel members to be good or very good, and 89% felt that having a student panel member added significant value. The Senate considered and approved the ITLR's overarching recommendations, and the large-scale mobilisation of the University community behind the ITLR process generated and shared a wealth of best practice, led to immediate in-year investment in Directors of Student Experience (para 5), work placement officers, and well-being provision where further particular needs were identified, and focused debate on overcoming any key barriers to taking strategic developments forward.

2.1 Student Engagement (TQ1)

8. Warwick's commitment to discipline-specific pedagogies provides for diverse and excellent teaching methods to engage and support students. Disciplinary teaching methods are accompanied by innovative approaches to teaching and learning, actively encouraged through funded projects and facilities across the University. Sciences teaching will typically involve significant practical work, supported by small group tutorials, lectures, problem classes and project work. Arts and Humanities learning may revolve around seminars, film screenings, oral language classes, lectures and performance. Social Sciences delivery methods will include ample debate and critical review as well as group and project work. Extensive professional practice will be seen in subjects such as Medicine and Counselling. The Institute for Advanced Teaching and Learning (IATL), and the Warwick International Higher Education Academy (WIHEA), in conjunction with individual departments, conduct pedagogical research and evaluation to enhance standard and innovative teaching methods (para 27, 28). [TQ1, TQ2, LE2]

9. Reinforcing our outstanding employment outcomes, the metrics demonstrate strong student engagement with teaching and learning. Students score Warwick's teaching above the NSS benchmark and provide high scores in our Student Barometer results (2017, n=2798), including: expert lecturers 96.6%, good teachers 88.0%, quality of lectures 88.9%, and course organisation 84.9%. The 2015 Accepters and Decliners Survey (3729 respondents), which seeks feedback from applicants to the University, shows that those who apply to Warwick seek engagement with a high quality but exceptionally challenging experience. Applicants further expect Warwick to offer good quality (90%), be ambitious (81%), challenging (77%) and prestigious (76%). Across the split metrics the University's scores are within the benchmark for NSS for teaching, and in relation to intellectual stimulation, Warwick is ranked 18th amongst all HEIs in the sector with a score of 90%. The exceptions are part-time courses and a course at the UG/PG boundary for mature students. Both these relate to types of provision which are very specific and non-traditional in nature and are detailed below. [TQ1]

10. *NSS Split metrics for PG/UG Boundary and Mature Students.* The University of Warwick is one of only two providers in the UK offering a graduate entry four-year intensive medicine degree. The programme is a strategically important and alternative route into medical training but also highly challenging. Students start their clinical training in Trusts in the second year of their degree, spending relatively less time based at the University compared with traditional five-year degrees. Nevertheless, these highly committed students proceed to have very successful careers, with 52.8% of Warwick graduates entering specialty training direct from Foundation Stage 2 in 2016—the third highest proportion in the UK. In 2017, Warwick students were placed 5th in the UK Foundation Programme Office's Situation Judgement Test. These students comprise 51% of Warwick's full-time mature student population and 30% of the students in the UG/PG boundary category. Despite these excellent student outcomes, NSS scores for this course in recent years have not reflected the programme's quality which in turn has created a negative impact on the University's NSS scores for these two categories of split metrics. Steps have been taken to address these issues, including the introduction of a new curriculum (2013); improved communication during the three years whilst students are learning in the hospital setting; new academic technology usage; and revised assessment practices and guidance. [TQ1, TQ4, SO1]

11. *NSS metrics for Part-time Provision.* Although our part-time population accounts for 8% of the overall student population on average over the three years eligible for TEF (1130 headcount), respondents to the NSS accounted for only 1.2% (96 headcount). Similarly, the population used to calculate non-continuation rates is very low at 2.5% (208 headcount). It is important to note that approximately 74% of Warwick's part-time population relates to low-credit bearing and short courses which are delivered in a continuing professional development context or closed courses, which are not eligible for NSS. 80% of the part-time population either follow highly vocational or continuing professional development courses leading to high employability outcomes. Populations have been reducing over the qualifying period: changes in learners'

needs and interests and also in funding models have led to declining registrations on open studies programmes. The University took the decision to tailor our offering in this area and to transfer some provision to non-accredited courses to support learners' interests more effectively. Correspondingly, an improvement in continuation rates can be seen between the indicator in the TEF2 metrics (75.7%) and that for TEF3 (82.7%).

12. All students at Warwick enjoy opportunities to engage with a learning experience *beyond disciplinary boundaries* both within and outside the curriculum, further supporting academic excellence and the strength of long-term outcomes as reflected in the positively flagged employability metrics.
    - Interdisciplinarity: learning across disciplines develops graduates able to comprehend and connect diverse forms of knowledge in order to address complex global challenges, and with the flexibility to move across different modes of learning, skills, and employability (section 2.1.1);
    - Internationalisation: developing intercultural skills and understanding of the world and their place in it enables graduates to contribute positively to a global society and work effectively within a variety of employment environments (section 2.1.2);
    - Student Research: engaging in a community of scholars, further developing capabilities of independent enquiry through personal research projects or through engagement with leading researchers in their discipline, provides for graduates equipped with leading research, analytical and employability skills (section 2.1.3).

    The ITLR underlined the high degree of commitment of staff and students to beyond-boundary learning and its embedding within Warwick's programmes of study. [TQ1, TQ3]

2.1.1 Interdisciplinary engagement

13. The majority of our programmes offer interdisciplinary learning within the curriculum but many students also choose to engage with learning outside their chosen programmes. In 2015/16 and 2016/17, 46% of our undergraduate students undertook a module outside their own discipline. Analysis of NSS 2017 free text comments demonstrates that the most frequently cited positive topic was the wide choice of modules available and the extent to which this allowed students to tailor the course to their specific needs, career plans, and interests. [LE3]

14. Warwick further offers a number of sector-leading and fully interdisciplinary courses, including: Mathematics, Operational Research, Statistics and Economics (MORSE); Philosophy, Politics and Economics (PPE); Liberal Arts; Global Sustainable Development; and the Nuffield Foundation-funded Q-Step programmes on quantitative methods in Social Sciences. In 2016/17 new Liberal Arts and Global Sustainable Development programmes attracted 6 applications for each place offered, showing the strength of interest in this type of course.

15. For the past seven years IATL has focussed particularly strongly on research into interdisciplinary pedagogies and developing bespoke interdisciplinary learning, with investment totalling £3.8m over the period. IATL provides pedagogical expertise and assistance for the design and delivery phases of interdisciplinary modules taught by staff in IATL and other departments and to students from across the majority of departments. Thoroughly boundary-shifting, IATL-developed modules utilise innovative delivery methods such as Open Space Learning, or are delivered in conjunction with Monash University using the University's International Portal. Numbers of students taking these IATL interdisciplinary modules have doubled between 2014/15 and 2016/17 to 359 from 26 departments (2016/17). [TQ1, TQ3]

2.2.2 International student engagement

16. Internationalisation as Warwick's second key education characteristic allows for engagement with the highly international community present on the campus itself, the development of a global perspective and intercultural awareness through study and interactions with peers and staff, and the accessing of mobility opportunities. Students highly value the development of a

global outlook, and employers also prize our students for this intellectual quality and adaptability (Evidence Box 1) [TQ1, TQ3, SO2].

Evidence Box 1: Summer 2015* Student Barometer (SB) and International Student Barometer (ISB): Global engagement learning experience	
*Data not yet available for 2017 survey	ISBSB n=3218
Developing the skills to work effectively in global contexts is very important to me	92%
I find it easy to socialise with people who are from different countries	86%
The University's goal of preparing graduates for an increasingly global society is important to me	88%
Within my friendship groups, there are people from different countries	86%
My experiences on my degree programme are helping me develop the skills needed for working effectively in international contexts	79%
I learn a lot doing group work with people from different countries	77%

17. The University's highly international outlook is reflected in the composition of its staff and student populations. 40% of the University's academic staff were non-UK in 2015/16, providing a truly global perspective to the curriculum; while in 2016/17, 34% of the University's students were from outside the UK, compared with a sector average of 19% of UK undergraduates drawn from a non-UK background.

Evidence Box 2: (Data: HESA 2016/17 Staff Return)			
All staff		Non-UK Staff	
Academic	2855	Academic	1207
Professional and support	3784	Professional and support	421
Total	6639	Total	1628

Evidence Box 3: (Data: HESA 2016/7 Student Record)					
All students				Undergraduate Affiliation	
Undergraduate (non UK)	16113 (4220)	64% (26%)		Arts	17.8%
Postgraduate (non UK)	8934 (4236)	36% (47%)		Science	36%
Total students (non UK)	25047 (8456)	100% (34%)		Social Sciences	38.6%
				Medicine	7.6%
UG Applicants/Intake	33609 / 3838				

18. International learning opportunities take many forms, involving work or study abroad for a full-year or a shorter placement, summer schools (for instance in Beijing), or internships and volunteering (for instance Warwick in Africa and the Laksh project in India providing teaching in local communities). Take-up of mobility opportunities is growing, and Warwick has already met the Bologna 2020 target of 20% of eligible students undergoing a period of study or training abroad. Study abroad opportunities are available in approximately 40 countries worldwide, and partner institutions are reviewed through the University's governance structures to ensure they offer students a high quality educational experience. [TQ1, TQ3, LE3, SO2]

Evidence Box 4: Student Mobility			
	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17
Erasmus + and exchange study placements	368	443	510
Erasmus + and exchange work placements	114	111	132
Warwick in Venice	59	111	65
Warwick in Africa	55	74	65
Laksh Project in India	12	12	12
School of Engineering African Field Course	25	11	9
Other (summer schools and URSS etc)	22	20	34
Total student numbers outbound	655	782	822

19. A core component of Warwick's internationalisation strategy is its partnership with Monash University. The Monash-Warwick Alliance encompasses not only student and staff mobility but also mutual support and acceleration of learning in teaching practice, pedagogic research, and delivery of innovative modules. Since the foundation of the Alliance in 2012, over 1000 students from both institutions have engaged with its activities through mobility exchanges, participation in joint modules, and contributing to and editing an undergraduate research journal. The achievements of the Alliance have been recognised with the award of the 'Excellence in Innovation in Partnership and International Engagement' at the Victorian International Education Awards in Melbourne, Australia. In 2016, almost 90 Warwick students from across 16 departments studied at Monash and in 2017/18 this has risen to 121 students.

20. Partly driven by interests originating in the Students' Union, Warwick has further embarked on reviewing the international character of curricula at the departmental level. Developments have focused on curriculum content such as the broadening of literature beyond the European-American canon or the introduction of modules addressing Islamic values in financial management. In addition, attention has focussed on the pedagogical challenges of internationalisation, such as developing intercultural and global awareness, deepening engagement between national and international student groups on campus, and increasing inclusivity for international students in assessment practices, collaborative working, and placements. In support of international mobility and future careers, and in response to greatly growing demand, Warwick's sector-leading intercultural training has now been extended and made available for all students. Participation in the first stage of this training has increased from 27 in 2013/14 to 248 in 2016/17, with 271 having participated in Term 1 alone in 2017/18. This provision has attracted international attention and the evaluation tool developed by Warwick is now used by i-Graduate—a major provider of international education comparative insights—to assist institutions in benchmarking student intercultural attitudes and awareness. [TQ1, SO2]

2.1.3 Engagement in Student Research (LE2)

21. Warwick in 2017 undertook a review of student research opportunities and activities in every department, evidencing the pervasive engagement in research-based learning across all types and levels of provision. Students engage with research within the curriculum through dissertations and research projects, and modules containing elements of research and research-informed teaching—led by high-achieving research active staff or research students. All students additionally have the opportunity to engage with research through co-curricular activities, again available on all modes of provision, and including funded research projects, presentations at national or international conferences of undergraduate research, and publications in undergraduate research journals. [LE2, TQ3, LE3]

22. The Undergraduate Research Scholarship Scheme (URSS) provides a highly supportive environment for students to develop research skills. They receive mentoring, skills training and funding for summer research projects, many of which are undertaken abroad, thereby also enabling students to stretch their learning and broaden their intercultural skills. Following increased international interest in Warwick's approach to students learning beyond the boundaries of research, an exchange scheme for students with Hong Kong University on student research placements has now been agreed. Over 600 students have benefitted from URSS awards from 2014/15 to 2016/17, with over £560k having been allocated in awards in the period. Student engagement in research challenges students' skills and abilities and offers intellectual stretch. Whilst 29% of our general student population achieves a first, for URSS project students the proportion is 54%. [LE2, TQ1, TQ3, SO2]

23. Combining international learning and research, IATL's International Conference of Undergraduate Research (ICUR) is an annual two-day conference designed to showcase the best student researchers from across the world, linking them virtually using cutting-edge technology. Jointly run by Warwick and Monash since 2013, ICUR has expanded by 2017 to

include a total of 8 institutions worldwide, including: Baruch College, City University of New York, USA; Kyushu University, Japan; Nanyang Technological University, Singapore; University of Brawijaya, Indonesia; University of Leeds; University of Sussex; and Monash campuses in Australia, South Africa and Malaysia. Students are fully supported through ICUR to develop confidence and skills when presenting their research. The conference is run across multiple locations and time zones, and enables the student organisers to acquire unique organisational and leadership skills. ICUR has supported the presentation of over 1000 undergraduate research papers since 2013 and 264 Warwick students have given presentations since 2015. ICUR received an Honourable Mention in the 'International Partnerships' category at the 2017 Andrew Heskell Awards for Innovation in International Education. Warwick's students also present their research at the British Conference for Undergraduate Research and 105 students have participated since 2014. [LE2, TQ1, SO2]

24. An undergraduate research publication, Reinvention, was launched by Warwick and Oxford Brookes University in 2007 and is now run jointly with Monash University. Reinvention has a student editorial board drawn from the two universities and is produced jointly and managed by staff and students. Reinvention's strong and sustainable academic community provides peer mentoring with structured support from staff and allows students an insight into the world of publishing and the enhancement of their own research skills. Since its launch, 210 papers by students in 11 countries and from 40 subject areas have been published, with over 500 students having submitted their work and received feedback. [LE2, SO2]

25. To promote the wide range of co-curricular research opportunities available across the University, a web-based and single point of entry student research portal has recently been launched, explicitly highlighting the long-term academic and professional impact of engagement with research as well as the accessibility of the opportunities available. [LE2, SO2]

2.2 Valuing Teaching (TQ2)

26. Warwick is committed to nurturing a culture that values teaching and research in equal measure. This commitment is evidenced through investment in the development of excellent teaching practices, and reward and recognition structures celebrating staff achievements. Moreover, Warwick recognises that outstanding teaching is not just a staff matter. A network of 700 student course representatives contribute to the constant evaluation and redesign of the student learning experience. Student evaluations, feedback, and co-design of learning are pivotal to teaching success and learning outcomes. Hence, strong student engagement is manifested in Warwick's reward and recognition processes for excellent teaching. [TQ2]

27. The Warwick International Higher Education Academy (WIHEA) was established in 2015—the very first of its kind in the UK. Warwick has committed £5 million to WIHEA to promote further outstanding teaching and learning through staff and student collaborations. Student and staff representatives from academic departments and professional services are nominated competitively to become WIHEA Fellows within a structure that gives prominence and prestige to education leaders, regardless of their seniority and role. Fellows assume roles in University governance, conduct seminars, engage in cross-departmental pedagogical consultancy, develop policy and guidance, contribute to a pedagogical journal club, and undertake leadership development opportunities. Fellows have access to Academy-only funding for development projects and can engage nationally and internationally with peers so as to engage in the latest education innovations worldwide. Fellowships last normally for 3 years and the Academy currently has 87 Fellows. The Academy enables Fellows to invest in their own career development while further embedding outstanding teaching practices across the disciplines. One of the recent outcomes of the Academy has been its research input into revised promotion criteria providing parity of recognition for teaching and research. [TQ2]

28. Key themes for WIHEA's activities are aligned to the strategic themes of a Warwick education: interdisciplinarity, internationalisation and student research. WIHEA invites internationally and

nationally-renowned leaders in education to the University to share insights and experiences with Fellows. 'Learning Circles' allow staff and student Fellows to share expertise and engage in research on particular themes to inform University strategic and policy thinking on sector developments and academic practice challenges. For example, a current Learning Circle is focused on learner analytics and is informing dialogue and best practice, whilst another involving staff and students is using the latest internationally-sourced research to reshape policy and practice on module evaluations. WIHEA's activities are complemented by IATL which supports experimental innovation in teaching and learning projects involving staff and students from across the University. [TQ2]

29. For over a decade, the Warwick Awards for Teaching Excellence (WATE) have showcased good practice and the dedication of staff to teaching across the University. Nominations are made by both staff and students. 126 Awards have been made in total (£5000 project awards for WATE winners, £2000 for commendees), and 50 Awards have been made to postgraduate research students who teach. WATE winners are supported in applying for HEA National Teaching Fellowships (NTFs) and Warwick has an exceptional success rate in the scheme, with 20 National Teaching Fellowships (NTF) having been awarded to Warwick staff, and the unprecedented award of 3 NTFs in 2016. [TQ2]

30. In common with other HE institutions, Warwick has an established career promotion framework, set against criteria which align to the UK Professional Standards Framework. Promotions focused around teaching are increasing steadily, and the criteria for promotions are currently under revision to reinforce Warwick's commitment to parity of esteem for teaching and research. Teaching excellence is expected as part of the combined (teaching and research) promotion routes as well as the Teaching Fellow route. During the TEF period, the proportion of teaching specialised staff promoted to professorial level increased from 5.4% (2014/15) to 6.1% (2015/16) and most recently 7.4% (2016/17), further illustrating both the outstanding quality of our specialist teaching staff and the culture of reward and recognition for teaching at Warwick. [TQ2]

31. Warwick staff have developed their professional practice in many contexts, some at overseas institutions, many in UK universities, and some in other educational settings in the UK. All new members of academic staff are required to possess or gain a higher education teaching qualification or otherwise provide evidence of engagement with a range of professional development activities and a proven and sustained track record of teaching and supporting learning in HE. Professional development for new and existing staff is available through the University's Learning and Development Centre. The proportion of staff holding teaching qualifications has grown from 37% 2014/15 to 46.9% in 2016/17. In addition, staff and research students who teach are encouraged to gain professional recognition for their practice and the numbers of staff with Fellowship of the HEA has risen from 6% in 2012/13 to 27% in 2016/17, equivalent to the average for the Russell Group. [LE2]

2.3 Rigour and Stretch (TQ3)

32. The staff and student community view academic rigour and intellectual stretch as core to a Warwick education. Warwick students are known to seek this challenging education experience (para 9)—with an average A-level attainment of AAB over the last decade—and employers value these qualities in Warwick students. The HEFCE Annual Provider Review 2016 raised no concerns with respect to risks to academic standards or quality of the student learning experience and ITLR in 2017, drawing heavily on external panel members through its departmental and faculty phases, supported this view. External input is a constant and core feature of the maintenance of our academic standards in all our processes of periodic review, external examining, and PSRBs. [TQ1, TQ3]

33. Rigorous and constant engagement with external benchmarking is used to monitor and maintain academic standards. For instance, in 2008 more equity between Social Sciences and Arts assessment and Sciences assessment marking scales was established by introducing a

standardised mark scale across the University. The impact of this was monitored to ensure measures had been effective and that standards had been maintained. More recently, the mark scheme has been reviewed to move from a 17-point to a 20-point scale for introduction in 2017/18, again in light of external examiners' comments on the distribution of marks at the upper and lower end of the scale. [TQ3]

34. The University has 56 undergraduate degrees (and variants) accredited or recognised by 20 PSRBs across 11 departments in Medicine, Sciences, and Social Sciences. PSRBs, QAA Subject Benchmarks, external examiners' expectations, and critical student feedback ensure our standards are under constant scrutiny and adjusted accordingly. [TQ3]

35. Data provided on degree classifications shows that there has been an uplift of 5% in the proportion of 1st class degrees awarded over 10 years to 2016/17, no change in the proportion of 2:1 degrees, and a decrease of 4% in the proportion of 2:2 degrees awarded. Standards have been rigorously maintained through regular review of outcomes, including input from external examiners. Strong investment in support for students and the extensive involvement of all of our students in learning beyond boundaries explain the modest uplift in first class degree awards. Warwick's degree classification data are compared annually with those of other institutions to benchmark standards and are well within the sector average and lower than institutions similar to Warwick. [TQ3]

2.4 Feedback (TQ4)

36. Warwick is committed to ensuring that assessment and feedback support students' learning effectively. Assessment methods are expected to vary to suit the discipline and the skills and competences concerned. The most effective method for delivery and enhancement of feedback is the subject of ongoing dialogue with students at the level of the discipline. In response to student requests on timeliness of feedback, a minimum timescale was established in 2011 and relevant NSS scores on this particular issue improved considerably thereafter. To accompany feedback on coursework, all departments introduced feedback on examinations from 2016/17. For NSS 2017, Warwick is placed in the second highest quintile for this question. ISB and SB (2017) also show a 90.1% satisfaction rate with assessment and an 83.5% satisfaction rate with performance feedback. [TQ4]

37. The ITLR recognised the need to make even further progress on assessment and feedback policies and practices. A University-wide Assessment Review has initiated four work streams to enhance exam board procedures, remedying failure, mitigating circumstances, and assessment strategies. Informed by the collaborative working of staff and students, the review is introducing further substantive improvements to academic practice. In addition, despite Warwick's existing successful outcomes in highly skilled employment, there is a recognition that ambitious skills development can be fostered through innovation in assessment and feedback methods. The review has thus sought to develop new assessment methods—authentic to disciplines and for employability skills—for embedding across all departments. Moreover, the review is focussing on the need for ensuring equity for all student groups in this aspect of teaching and learning. Issues relating to NSS outcomes for courses at the UG/PG boundary and for mature students have been noted (para 10). Some lower scores for BME students are also evident. Although assessment scores for black students are comparable with the benchmark, Asian students show a lower level of satisfaction. Hence, noting the diversity of our student community, the review aims to expand the range of assessment methods used across all provision, and ensure that the timing and methods best support students' learning and future outcomes. [TQ3, TQ4, SO2]

3. Learning Environment

3.1 Resources (LE1)

38. Warwick recognises the importance of continuous investment in learning resources to provide excellent support for students' needs, especially as the interface of technology and physical

resources continues to create new enhancement opportunities. Our commitment is exemplified through the development of outstanding new teaching spaces, and innovative and flexible Learning Grids and social study spaces both on and off campus. [LE1]

39. In 2016/17, Warwick opened the Oculus (£18.5m), a new teaching and learning building providing state of the art, flexible teaching spaces, to meet the range of pedagogical needs from different disciplines. This includes pioneering integration of internal and external learning spaces as rooms open to landscaped areas outside the building. Critically, social and network spaces in the building are also designed specifically to support interactive and digital learning, reflecting students' learning needs, and have proved highly popular. This builds on investment in the innovative Learning and Teaching Grids (£2.87m). The four Learning Grids provide flexible learning environments across the campus and in Leamington Spa, where many students reside, to support both independent and group study, focusing on team-working and the development of presentation and communication skills. Facilities include panaboards, plasma screens, SMARTboards and presentation rooms with screens and audio. Supporting specific disciplinary and pedagogical needs, the BioMed Grid provides resources for Biological Sciences and Medical students including a bookable Clinical Skills area equipped with medical instruments. Students' learning in these spaces is also supported through face-to-face assistance from staff and Student Community Engagement Assistants, and students providing peer support. Spaces are further used to run 'Study Happy' events focusing on students' wellbeing as well as study skills sessions. Since 2014 students also have access to learning space in the London Shard where our Business School occupies a floor entirely for teaching and learning purposes. [LE1]

40. Collaboration between staff and students has been fundamental to developing these spaces to ensure that they can optimally support students' needs. Student communities co-designed the Oculus, including specifying space and equipment needs and addressing design issues. As a result, the Oculus provides for considerable social learning and community building space. More recently, students have been working with staff to identify and convert spaces in the Sciences Concourse, Social Sciences ground floor and the Humanities Building to study spaces, resulting in an additional 210 spaces being provided for 2017/18 and designed to meet students' study needs, from furniture design to accessibility of power sockets and proximity to refreshments. In 2016/17 the Library was opened on a 24/7 basis in response to student feedback and following operational planning with students. In 2015/16, the Library held over 1 million books and print journals, and 991k e-resources, with 4.3 million e-books accessed, and receiving 2.3 million visits online. Library information resource provision totalled £5.3 million. The 2017 Student Barometer shows a satisfaction rate of 92.5% for library provision. [LE1]

41. The University's investment in teaching spaces is mirrored in the provision of the experimental Teaching Grid, a highly flexible space for staff to develop their own skills. Support is provided to staff to identify and integrate the use of advanced technology into their teaching. This includes, for instance, the use of multimedia equipment allowing students to develop video-editing projects and receive training at peer-led workshops. [LE1]

42. An institutional teaching space group, involving staff and students and drawing on student feedback, oversees the annual spend of £1 million on the continuous improvement of existing teaching spaces. The 2017 Student Barometer recorded 89.5% satisfaction with learning spaces. The building of bespoke environments for Engineering activity (£6.6m), Mathematics (£29.5m) and apprenticeship learning (£10m) is also underway**.** [LE1]

43. Significant investment has also been made in lecture capture (£474k from 2013/14) now available in over 80 teaching rooms across campus and fully integrated with Moodle, ensuring seamless access to recordings for students. Lecture capture recordings have increased from 1014 in 2013/14 to 9105 in 16/17 with viewings having increased from over 57k in 2013/14 to 1.2 million in 2016/17. In 2015/16, two WIHEA-funded student-staff research projects investigated students' experience of lecture capture across three departments and found that

the technology improved students' understanding of content, supported assessment performance and particularly helped auditory learners, thereby supporting specific learning requirements. [LE2, LE3, SO3]

44. The ongoing investment and responsiveness to students has seen the University's NSS score for Learning Resources improve from 86% in 2016 to 86.5% in 2017, compared to the sector average decline from 86% to 85.1%. Levels of satisfaction are either at or above the sector average can be seen across the majority of categories of students, including students with disabilities and all ethnic groups. [LE1]

3.2 Scholarship, Research and Professional Practice (LE2)

45. Warwick is a research-intensive university ranked 8th nationally in REF2014 and its research is inextricably linked to teaching and student experience. This has been extensively addressed under 'Student Engagement' (2.1) as Warwick views engagement with research as core to the student experience (paras 21-25). Our academic community also engages in research of higher education pedagogy itself through IATL (para 28), WIHEA (para 27-28), and through local efforts in departments. Scholarship of teaching is an explicit element of our promotion expectations for anyone who teaches (para 27). [LE2]

46. The vast majority of staff and students who teach are highly research active within their subject. 83.5% of academic staff (930.68 FTE) were submitted in the REF and 19 Warwick departments are in the top 10 in their subject. The drive to go 'beyond boundaries' in research is wholly consistent with our drive to stretch students' learning beyond boundaries. Moreover, benefitting from our collaborations with industry and professional sectors, Warwick engages students with likely future professional challenges, for instance through writing policy briefs for government, placements in industry, or teaching by practitioners. Particularly noteworthy is the appointment of Professors of Practice who have moved from higher professional careers into Warwick to teach, collaborate with industry, business and the professions, and further support our students' learning beyond boundaries. [TQ1, TQ3, LE2]

3.3 Personalised learning (LE3)

47. Warwick attracts talented students from all backgrounds with high expectations of success and is committed to supporting them all through their journey to achieve their expected outcomes, whilst recognising that individual students' needs will vary. Departments track and monitor student progress and students are guided by academic advice from Directors of Study or Personal Tutors. High continuation and academic attainment illustrate that this has been a successful strategy. Nonetheless, the University has started a review of systems and is investing in human and digital resources to enhance support for individual students. [LE3, SO3]

48. The University has also undertaken a programme of investment in Director of Student Experience posts; these posts are located in academic departments and provide capacity for leading significant education enhancement projects and in student engagement. In the qualifying period these posts were located in 11 departments, with 4 further posts being created or filled more recently, 2 of which will collectively support a number of smaller departments. Examples of the developments led by these posts include the spearheading of feedback on exams in Politics and International Studies, a new module feedback mechanism in Law, and the development of the Digichamps scheme in Life Sciences where students are appointed to work with academic staff on the use of technology in education. In departments where these coordinating posts have been in place for even a single year, improvements of up to 11.5% in NSS overall satisfaction scores have been seen, with all those departments scoring over 90% in 2016. [LE3]

49. Significant investment in advice, guidance and student wellbeing has also been made centrally to supplement that already available in departments. New roles of Dean of Students and Faculty Senior Tutors were appointed in 2016/17 focusing on strategic and Faculty leadership

of academic pastoral support (£230k pa). A major review of the University's Personal Tutoring system followed in 2016/17. Academic pastoral support at Warwick has developed to suit distinct pedagogical and academic needs, with one-to-one meetings being the norm in many departments and weekly small group problem-solving sessions better suiting Science disciplines. The Review drew on the most effective of these approaches to further disseminate best practice and expand support for students' academic development across the University. In 2017, the Student Barometer showed a 92.4% satisfaction with personal tutoring. Recognising the specific needs of student cohorts, investment has also been made in posts supporting student wellbeing and students with disabilities (£740k from 2016). The 2017 Student Barometer showed 82.6% satisfaction with disability support. [SO3] Warwick's Welcome Week is distinctive in focussing strongly not just on a range of academic support opportunities but also the personal tutorial system, wellbeing, and disability support, Our NSS metrics show that satisfaction with academic support is generally in line with the sector for the majority of student categories, but is significantly better for black students. Negative flags for mature and the PG/UG boundary category have already received comment and contextualisation in 2.1. [LE3]

50. Warwick provides dedicated in-house central provision for students to meet the requirements of the Equality Act. This is complemented by a high level of embedded support for key points of study need, such as the Library's dedicated facilities and services, including a Disability Support Officer and use of assistive technology, and extensive lecture capture facilities support different learning needs (para 43). Transition activities are offered to those undergraduate students who require additional support prior to enrolment. For those who might experience additional financial barriers to accessing education, from 2016/17 Warwick introduced an ensuite on campus accommodation subsidy to assist students with costs. Students with disabilities who require on campus and/or accessible accommodation for the duration of their studies are also prioritised for on-campus accommodation through all years of study. [LE3]

51. The University has further taken advantage of technological developments to support students' personalised learning as well as strategic oversight of education. Use of Moodle as a VLE is complemented by a bespoke student administration system which supports attendance monitoring and assignment management, amongst other functions. This allows students to receive reminder emails before deadlines arrive, submit assignments and receive marks and feedback through a single system. In 2017, the Student Barometer showed a 91.6% satisfaction rate with the VLE. Advanced education analytics are available for all departments to monitor aggregate student performance and outcomes on an ongoing basis. However, to make best use of technology to support students' learning a major investment of £12m through SPIP is being made to modernise systems, processes and behaviours, working towards a more strongly integrated student data approach with a view to providing a seamless and personalised interface through the entire student life-cycle. Work streams include a focus on induction, learner analytics, timetabling, student interfaces with systems, employability, skills, welfare and supporting students on alternative pathways to higher education, including degree apprenticeships and foundation programmes. As part of the SPIP, Warwick launched the MyWarwick app, drawing together time-sensitive personalised information on mobile devices, including assessment deadlines and feedback, personal study timetables, available study spaces, library loans, traffic and travel information, and emails. This has proved enormously popular, with 62% of undergraduate students downloading the app within the first two days of the academic year, including nearly 90% of first year students. [LE3]

52. Continuation rates are high at Warwick and the 3-year indicator of 95.4% is within 0.4% of the threshold for very high absolute values. Continuation rates are particularly strong compared to the sector for part-time students, with positive flags for 8 of the 11 subcategories of students. Nevertheless, it is recognised that there are four categories of full-time students for whom continuation rates are below benchmark and the strategic measures set out in paragraphs 62 to 63 are intended to ensure these students are as equally able to fulfil their potential as other students. It should be noted, though, that of these four categories, Warwick's benchmark for Q1or Q2 POLAR (97%) and for male students (96.8%) is set above the threshold for very high

absolute values within the sector (95.78%), whilst that for Q1 or Q2 National IMD is only 0.18% below the threshold. Warwick's core metric benchmark for full-time students (96.9%) is also above the threshold for very high absolute values. [LE3, SO3]

4. Student Outcomes and Learning Gain

4.1 Employment and Further Study (SO1)

53. As the three positive flags on employability in the core metrics for the full-time majority mode illustrate, a Warwick education lays a foundation for graduates to fulfil their goals and to progress to achieve outstanding outcomes throughout their professional lives. These achievements also extend to part-time students where a double positive flag indicates highly positive outcomes compared to benchmark and in the top decile. Recognition is international and national, with The Economist 2017 rankings on which universities provide most value for students placing Warwick 3rd in the Russell Group and 17th in the sector. Warwick is 1st in the 2017 High Fliers ranking of institutions most targeted by the UK's top graduate employers and has been in the top 5 for the last 10 years. The University also ranks 4th in the sector for graduate salaries in 2015/16 (Times and Sunday Times). The QS World University Rankings 2016/17 place Warwick in the top 25 in the world for employer reputation [SO1, SO2].

54. The disciplinary and transferable skills that students gain through learning beyond boundaries at Warwick enables them to continue to progress in highly successful careers, outperforming the sector over time, and demonstrating the excellent value of their education. LEO data 3 years after graduation show that earnings above the median threshold are significantly above benchmark and in the upper decile. This outstanding position improves with time as the earnings of Warwick's students after 5 years are ranked more highly within the sector than 3 years after graduation. [SO1, SO2]

55. Warwick, a modern and relatively young university, takes pride in the pervasive nature of these outstanding achievements by its students. Whilst for some atypical provision achievement is comparable to benchmarks, all other provision leads to outstanding results, outperforming benchmarks that take into account background, ethnicity, gender, and domicile [SO3].

4.2 Employability and Transferable Skills (SO2)

56. Warwick has taken a discipline-specific approach to providing employability support with the key characteristics of student research, internationalisation, and interdisciplinarity contributing to transformational education and skills for students. This is complemented by a comprehensive range of departmental and central support programmes which together provide students with the skills and attributes to equip them for their careers. Departments develop annual employability plans supported by the Student Careers and Skills (SCS) service. Additional investment of £1m has recently been made in SCS and placement posts located in academic departments, at faculty, and at institutional level to provide tailored integration of employability support into student academic development. A work experience bursary is available for students who would not otherwise be able to access unpaid work placements. In addition, student and discipline-specific societies play a role in bringing employers and alumni to campus to support student career ambitions. All employability activity at Warwick is informed by and benefits from the continuous feedback and guidance of student representatives who take on ambassadorial roles to help students engage with career development schemes. Academic departments nurture their own links with employers relevant to their disciplines. Outstanding examples include the Warwick Manufacturing Group where industrial links span education, training and research. [LE3, SO2, SO3]

57. At institutional level, in 2015/16 almost 3000 undergraduate students attended advice and guidance appointments with SCS. In 2017, SCS reconfigured its resources to respond even more effectively to student demand. Careers Project Officers and Job Search Advisers work in tandem to provide additional support at peak periods in the Autumn and Spring terms, and SCS has secured new physical spaces through a 'hub and spokes' model across campus to

ensure further optimal accessibility to students at their sites of learning. In addition to human and physical resources, innovative digital technology is used to support student employability. SCS have produced a range of digital learning technologies on how to succeed in the graduate labour market, including over 200 two-minute careers advice video clips. SCS and students have also co-created employability advice through more than 100 videos filmed and edited by students. Using our MyPortfolio tool students are able to evidence and articulate to employers their unique Warwick experience and achievements both academically and through extra-curricular activities, with the system currently having 10,500 users. The 'Experience Pool' is an online portal which allows students to access all work experience opportunities that exist on campus, currently totalling 8,300. The Warwick's Careers Blog posts weekly, featuring contributions from students and staff, and to date has received 917,378 hits. [LE1, SO2]

58. An extensive range of opportunities are provided by the University for students seeking to develop their employability and transferable skills. These include intercultural learning, confidence and initiative, strengths-based recruitment, and managing your online profile. In 2016/17, there were 6018 attendances at workshops. The entire SCS team is trained in a strength-based assessment tool (the Institute of Student Employers reports that over 40% of graduate recruiters are now using strength based assessment), and can offer one-to-one one strengths profile feedback, as well as strengths-based group activities. Warwick has a particular focus on developing students' entrepreneurial skills with dedicated staff support. The Innovation and Entrepreneurship online programme helps students to develop their ideas from conception to delivery. Training, workshops and awards support students in developing their entrepreneurial skills and in developing start-up companies. Between 2014/15 and 2016/17 there were over 960 attendances at enterprise events and over 90 awards made to support start-ups. Warwick provides students with extensive opportunities to gain work experience, graduate opportunities and external contacts. Active employer numbers engaging with SCS have grown towards 3000, with over 400 coming to campus each year, and with an increasingly broad range of SMEs and community partners locally. SCS runs 150 employability events each year—the largest event attracting over 80 employers and some 3500 students. Warwick SCS offers life-time support to all of its graduates, including, for example, to contact 100% of 2016/17 summer graduates who wished to continue to receive careers support. [SO2]

59. Beyond the curriculum, Warwick Volunteers (WV) enables students to experience volunteering in schools and the local community, and to benefit from extending and learning new skills, connecting with other students and supporting the well-being of themselves and others, and demonstrating an aptitude for employability. WV is co-led by students and staff and has more than 75 student project leaders at any one time. WV is physically located in the Students' Union to maximise accessibility for students. Project leaders are provided with training to support developing their leadership and project management skills. WV registers almost 3000 student volunteers across all levels of study. In 2016-17, 1042 active volunteers (from 69 nationalities) contributed to 1473 volunteering placements. Students' achievements and their contribution to the University community are recognised through the Outstanding Student Contribution Awards (OSCA), which are presented at graduation ceremonies annually. OSCAs have included: establishing a cycle hire scheme on campus; instigating a Law careers summit; improving accessibility and awareness of issues related to living with a disability; starting a flashcard sharing learning tool for medical students; and designing careers-focused speaker programmes to develop students' employability skills. Achievements display enterprise, co-development of their education, and a commitment to improving the lives of wider communities locally and internationally. [SO2]

60. Warwick is also leading a major HEFCE-funded project (£796k) on understanding 'Learning Gain' which will provide evidence on approaches to measuring learning gain in the areas of curriculum measures and employability, to inform future national policy development. The project involves 18 Russell Group institutions and is an example of Warwick's role in leading educational excellence.

4.3 Positive Outcomes for All (SO3)

61. All Warwick's students benefit from our distinctively transformational approach to education and the complementary opportunities which lead to these outcomes. With exceptions only in relatively small aspects of provision, employability outcomes are outstanding for all students groups in both full-time and part-time provision. Issues around post-graduation medical education have been addressed already (para 10) and in other areas Warwick has put in place additional provision support specific groups, both in relation to employability as well as academic achievement.

62. In relation to employability there are a range of schemes for specific groups of learners, such as the Sprint Women's Development Programme, attended by 106 students in 2016/17, of which 54 were BME students. An ongoing 'Inspiring Women' Seminar series is open to all staff and students, and we have just entered into a partnership with the charity 'upReach' to work with us to provide enhanced (3 years per cohort) support for targeted WP students in the 1st and 2nd years. In support of Chinese students, Warwick was awarded funding from BIS and the British Council (£30k, 2017) to research the challenges that Chinese students face in seeking employment in China. This led to enhanced guidance and resources and additional funding (£65k) from the British Council China and the UK Foreign and Commonwealth Office to develop activities further and disseminate good practice. In 2017, Warwick was awarded Best Partner University in the World by Nu Skin, a leading Chinese employer, recognising its contribution to international student employability. [SO3]

63. In support of achieving academic success there are also a range of carefully targeted support programmes. The Centre for Lifelong Learning delivers 2+2 programmes for mature students and student returning to study and has in place a set of specific support measures including a student support team with specialist staff working in the areas of welfare and well-being, e-learning, and student engagement and communication. As a result, withdrawals from the programme on non-academic and academic grounds are close to zero, and well below national trends in adult learner non-completion rates. The Warwick Business School initiated in 2016/17 a Foundation Year programme that provides intensive study support for students lacking the qualifications for direct entry and accelerates their skills and learning to enable automatic progression into the BSc in Accounting and Finance or BSc Management. 100% of the 25 student cohort progressed to degree-level study in the first year of the programme at Warwick. A combination of financial, pastoral and academic support is provided through the Warwick Scholars Programme, specifically for students who have come to Warwick from living in care or through outreach programmes. Since the start of the qualifying period (2014/15), 70 students chose to become Scholars and are benefitting from the programme, including additional financial bursaries for study skills and internships, networking support for developing social capital and employability, and alumni mentoring. Noting the success of individual students on the WSP a similar Multicultural Scholars Programme provides support to low-income students from poorly represented ethnic groups within Law, Engineering and the Warwick Business School, with 92 students participating during the TEF period. We are also enhancing and extending provision for WP students to better access study abroad opportunities during their degree. [SO1, SO3]

Conclusion

64. Warwick's disciplinary excellence, combined with learning beyond boundaries through interdisciplinarity, internationalisation, and student research, ensures our students develop skills and experiences to prepare them for great success in their personal and professional futures. Warwick recognises a range of measures and metrics as demonstrating positive student outcomes, namely: excellent teaching, successful continuation and completion, quality of degree classifications, employment rates and degree reputation by employers. Consistent high achievement by Warwick students and staff across these combined measures, along with exceptional employer feedback, demonstrate outstanding levels of provision meeting the criteria for a TEF Gold award.